

Patent Application No. 09/754,813

REMARKS

This Response is in response to the Office Action dated December 9, 2004 ("Office Action"). By this Response, currently pending claims 1-15 and 17-20 are believed allowable, with claims 1, 11, and 18 being independent claims.

I. The Cited References do not Teach or Suggest All the Claim Limitations of the Claims

Claims 1, 4, 6-7, 10, 11, 13-15 and 17-21 were rejected under 35 USC §103(a) as being obvious over U.S. Patent No. 6,442,689 to Kocher (herein "Kocher") in view of U.S. Patent No. 6,128,740 to Curry et al. (herein "Curry") and in further view of U.S. Patent No. 6,411,956 to Ng (herein "Ng"). Office Action, paragraph 6. A *prima facie* case for obviousness can only be made if the combined reference documents teach or suggest all the claim limitations. MPEP 2143.

Before discussing the specifics of the claims, it is initially noted that in one embodiment of the invention, different CRL retrieval agents are used for different CRL distribution methods to consolidate CRLs from multiple CAs into a central CRL database. Application, page 5, lines 4-7. By doing so, the general problem of certificate revocation list consolidation, as discussed in detail in the Application, is avoided. Application, page 11, lines 4-6. In a specific implementation, different CRL retrieval agents are used to retrieve periodically CRL's from different CAs and consolidate them into a central CRL database. Application, page 11, lines 11-14.

Turning now to the claims, claim 1 recites, in part, "multiple CRL retrieval agents configured to periodically retrieve CRLs at time intervals from different CAs using a plurality of CRL retrieval agents based on the CRL distribution mechanisms of CAs." Application, claim 1. The Office Action indicates that neither Kocher nor Ng teach such limitations, but states, "Curry discloses periodically retrieving CRLs." Office Action, pages 2 and 4.

It is respectfully submitted that none of the references cited in the Office Action teach or suggest multiple CRL retrieval agents configured to periodically retrieve CRLs. Even if, *arguendo*, the allegations in the Office Action that Curry discloses periodically

Patent Application No. 09/754,813

retrieving CRLs are taken as true, there is still no reference provided that discloses multiple CRL retrieval agents configured to periodically retrieve CRLs. For at least this reason, claim 1 is believed allowable over the cited art and such allowance is earnestly solicited.

Claim 2-10 are dependent on and further limit claim 1. Since claim 1 is believed allowable, claims 2-10 are also believed allowable for at least the same reasons as claim 1.

Claim 11 recites, in part, "periodically retrieving CRLs at time intervals from different CAs using a plurality of CRL retrieval agents based on the CRL distribution mechanisms of CAs." Application, claim 11. The Office Action indicates that neither Kocher nor Ng teach such limitations, but states, "Curry discloses periodically retrieving CRLs." Office Action, page 6.

It is respectfully submitted that none of the references cited in the Office Action teach or suggest periodically retrieving CRLs at time intervals from different CAs using a plurality of CRL retrieval agents based on the CRL distribution mechanisms of CAs. Even if, *arguendo*, the allegations in the Office Action that Curry discloses periodically retrieving CRLs are taken as true, there is still no reference provided that discloses periodically retrieving CRLs at time intervals from different CAs using a plurality of CRL retrieval agents. For at least this reason, claim 11 is believed allowable over the cited art and such allowance is earnestly solicited.

Claims 12-15 and 17 are dependent on and further limit claim 11. Since claim 11 is believed allowable over the cited art, claims 12-15 and 17 are also believed allowable for at least the same reasons as claim 11.

Claim 18 recites, in part, "creating a plurality of CRL retrieval agents based on the CRL distribution mechanisms of CAs, the retrieval agents configured to periodically retrieve CRLs at time intervals from the different CAs and to consolidate the CRLs from multiple CAs." Application, claim 18. The Office Action states that claim 18 is rejected on the same grounds as claim 11. Office Action, page 11.

It is respectfully submitted that none of the references cited in the Office Action teach or suggest creating a plurality of CRL

Patent Application No. 09/754,813

retrieval agents based on the CRL distribution mechanisms of CAs, the retrieval agents configured to periodically retrieve CRLs at time intervals from the different CAs and to consolidate the CRLs from multiple CAs. Even if, *arguendo*, the allegations in the Office Action that Curry discloses periodically retrieving CRLs are taken as true, there is still no reference provided that discloses creating a plurality of CRL retrieval agents based on the CRL distribution mechanisms of CAs configured to periodically retrieve CRLs. For at least this reason, claim 11 is believed allowable over the cited art and such allowance is earnestly solicited.

Claims 19-21 are dependent on and further limit claim 18. Since claim 18 is believed allowable over the cited art, claims 19-21 are also believed allowable for at least the same reasons as claim 18.


CONCLUSION

In view of the forgoing remarks, it is respectfully submitted that this case is now in condition for allowance and such action is respectfully requested. If any points remain at issue that the Examiner feels could best be resolved by a telephone interview, the Examiner is urged to contact the attorney below.

No fee is believed due with this Response, however, should a fee be required please charge Deposit Account 50-0510. Should any extensions of time be required, please consider this a petition thereof and charge Deposit Account 50-0510 the required fee.

Respectfully submitted,

Dated: March 9, 2005


Ido Tuchman, Reg. No. 45,924
Law Office of Ido Tuchman
69-60 108th Street, Suite 503
Forest Hills, NY 11375
Telephone (718) 544-1110
Facsimile (718) 544-8588